The Atmospheres Node generally is in agreement with the Rings Node regarding the PDS4 Core document.

We would add the following to each of the points made by Mitch and Mark.

We agree that the purpose is not clearly stated within the document. We would argue further that some of the confusion in this document stems from the use of the word 'Core'. What we are concerned with is making sure the MC has enough information about the status of PDS4 to ensure that enough functionality is present to allow our data providers specifically tied to LADEE and MAVEN to provide their data in a usable form under PDS4 guidelines. 'Release Version 1.0' should only include support to ensure the entire system (ingestion, review, validation/registration, and distribution) is functional specific to the two initial missions. The term 'core' really refers to what is necessary for these two missions, not directly to PDS4 as a whole.

The 'minimum subset' requirements, as presented by the Rings Node, is the important part of this document, including identifying the intended audience for the Version 1.0 Release. Specifically the first priority of this release is the functionality for data providers (specifically LADEE and MAVEN). Data user services are not to be included in this build but should be in mind for the following releases. The second priority is to support early migration of similar datasets to LADEE and MAVEN. For example, if a node is not involved in the preparation of LADEE and MAVEN, their focus should be on migrating either simple datasets similar to those used by the other nodes (simple tables) or they should be looking to migrate the 'base' data types that are most common within their discipline. Any data types or additional class support should not be precluded as long as the base requirements (for LADEE and MAVEN) can be met. Documentation should then reflect what is actually in this release with "T.B.D"s listed for future releases.

We agree with the Rings Node's approach to the Version 1.0 naming dilemma. A third option could be a combination of their two suggestions:

PDS4 Version 1.0 (Beta Release for Data Providers)

The Rings Node timeline for Version 1.0 release looks accurate and workable. All further suggestions for additional planning documents listed by Rings should be provided. Spreadsheets as listed will be essential as checklists for the team to maintain focus and ensure we finish this essential subset of PDS4 in time for the Version 1.0 release.